Compare and Contrast Perspectives

**Goals:** Students will become more familiar with the Confederated Tribes of Grand Ronde. Students will compare and contrast two different perspectives regarding the first contact between Natives and settlers.

**Oregon Common Core Standards:**

- 6-8.RH.6 Identify aspects of a text that reveal an author’s point of view or purpose (e.g., loaded language, inclusion or avoidance of particular facts).
- 6-8.RH.8 Distinguish among fact, opinion, and reasoned judgment in a text.

**Oregon Social Sciences Academic Content Standards:**

- Historical Knowledge 8.4 Evaluate the impact of different factors, including gender, age, ethnicity and class on groups and individuals during this time period and the impact these groups and individuals have on events of the time.
- Historical Thinking 8.8 Evaluate information from a variety of sources and perspectives.

**Objectives:**

- Students will be able to compare and contrast the First Ship Seen by the Clatsop and the journal entries by women on the Oregon Trail.
Lesson Plan

Unit: Grand Ronde Tribal History

Lesson Title: Compare and Contrast Perspectives

Rational: This lesson will introduce students to two different perspectives, the Native perspective and the settler’s perspective regarding their first encounters with each other.

Goals: Students will become more familiar with the Confederated Tribes of Grand Ronde. Students will compare and contrast two different perspectives regarding the first contact between Natives and settlers.

Oregon Common Core Standards:

- 6-8.RH.6 Identify aspects of a text that reveal an author’s point of view or purpose (e.g., loaded language, inclusion or avoidance of particular facts).
- 6-8.RH.8 Distinguish among fact, opinion, and reasoned judgment in a text.

Oregon Social Sciences Academic Content Standards:

- Historical Knowledge 8.4 Evaluate the impact of different factors, including gender, age, ethnicity and class on groups and individuals during this time period and the impact these groups and individuals have on events of the time.
- Historical Thinking 8.8 Evaluate information from a variety of sources and perspectives.

Objectives:

- Students will be able to compare and contrast the First Ship Seen by the Clatsop and the journal entries by women on the Oregon Trail.

Materials Needed:

- ✓ Compare and contrast worksheet
- ✓ “First Ship Seen by the Clatsop” article
- ✓ Journals, diaries, and letters written by women on the Oregon trail 1836-1865
- ✓ Optional Venn Diagram
- ✓ Vocabulary sheet

Time: Two 50 minute periods

Anticipatory set: Begin the lesson by asking students what the term, “Perspective” means. After discussing this vocabulary word ask students what the term, “Native perspective” means. Explain to students that often times the Native American perspective is not heard in traditional textbooks. We often hear of Native history through accounts of immigrants or
settlers, which is the settler's perspective, but never the Native perspective. The Native perspective is their experience told from their viewpoint.

- **Lesson Steps:**
  1. Hand out two short readings for students to complete. The two articles can be read aloud as a class or individually. One article is from the perspective of a Native American and how they felt about contact with the first Spaniards they came in contact with. The second article is written from the point of view of European women on the Oregon Trail and their first impression of the Natives.
  2. Have students compare the two different perspectives and analyze how the different perspectives contribute to the feelings in the articles. Pass out the compare and contrast worksheet and discuss the questions as a class.

**Differentiation:** Discussion regarding the two articles can be done with partners, in groups or as a whole class. Students can fill out the optional Venn Diagram prior or after the worksheet depending on learning styles in the classroom.

**Early Finisher Activity:** None

**Assessment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student was able to describe what</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>happened to the Native Americans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>when the Europeans arrived</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes/Other:**

**Attachments:**

- ✓ Compare and contrast worksheet
- ✓ Compare and contrast worksheet answer key
- ✓ “First Ship Seen by the Clatsop” article
- ✓ Journals, diaries, and letters written by women on the Oregon trail 1836-1865
- ✓ Optional Venn Diagram
**"First Ship Seen by the Clatsop"**

Retrieved From: *Oregon Indians* by Stephen Dow Beckham

The son of an old woman had died. She wailed for him a whole year and then she stopped. Now one day she went to Seaside. There she used to stop, and she returned. She returned walking along the beach. She nearly reached Clatsop; now she saw something. She thought it was a whale. When she came near it she saw two spruce trees standing upright on it. She thought, "Behold! it is no whale. It is a monster."

She reached the thing that lay there. Now she saw that its outer side was all covered with copper. Ropes were tied to those spruce trees and it was full of iron. Then a bear came out of it. He stood on the thing that lay there. It looked just like, a bear, but his face was that of a human being. Then she went home. Now she thought of her son, and cried, saying, "Oh, my son is dead and the thing about which we heard in tales is on shore."

When she nearly reached the town she continued to cry. [The people said,] "Oh, a person comes crying. Perhaps somebody struck her." The people made themselves ready. They took their arrows. An old man said, "Listen!" Then the people listened. Now she said all the time, "Oh, my son is dead, and the thing about which we heard in tales is on shore." The people said, "What may it be?" They went running to meet her. They said, "What is it?" "Ah, something lies there and it is thus. There are two bears on it, or maybe they are people." Then the people ran.

They reached the thing that lay there. Now the people [from the ship] held two copper kettles in their hands. Now the first [Clatsop] reached there. Another one arrived. Now the persons [from the ship] took their hands to mouths and gave the people their kettles. They had lids. The men pointed inland and asked for water. Then two people ran inland. They hid themselves behind a log. They returned again and ran to the beach. One man climbed up and entered the thing. He went down into the ship. He looked about in the interior of the ship; it was full of boxes. He found brass buttons in strings half a fathom long. He went out again to call his relatives, but they had already set fire to ship. He jumped down. Those two persons had also gone down. It burnt just like fat. Then the Clatsop gathered the iron, the copper, and the brass. Then all the people learned about it.
The two persons were taken to the chief of the Clatsop. Then the chief of the one town said, "I want to keep one of the men with me." The people almost began to fight. Now one of them was taken to that town. Then the chief was satisfied. Now the Quenaiult, the Chehalis, the Cascades, the Cowlitz, and the Klickatat learned about it and they all went to Clatsop. The Quenaiult, the Chehalis, and the Willapa went. The people of all the towns went there. The Cascades, the Cowlitz, and the Klickatat came down the river. All those of the upper part of river came down to Clatsop. Strips of copper two fingers wide and going around the arm were exchanged for one slave each. A piece of iron as long as one-half the forearm was exchanged for one slave. A piece of brass two fingers wide was exchanged for one slave. A nail was sold for a good curried deerskin. Several nails were given for long dentalia [shells used for decoration and as a form of currency]. The people bought this and the Clatsop became rich. Then iron and brass were seen for the first time. Now they kept these two persons [from the ship]. One was kept by each chief; one was at the Clatsop town at the cape.
The lifestyle of the Indians of Idaho and Oregon interested the emigrant women. Their diaries and journals contain observations and descriptions of the treatment and dress of Indian children, the foods grown, hunted, and cooked by the Indians, and Indian dances. Narcissa Whitman was moved to pity when she saw an Indian infant whose head was being flattened. In 1836 she wrote, "I saw an infant here (at Cascades) whose head was in the pressing machine. This was a pitiful sight. Its mother took great satisfaction in unbinding and showing its naked head to us. The child lay upon a board between which and its head was a squirrel skin. On its forehead laid a small square cushion, over which was a bandage drawn tight around pressing its head against the board. In this position it is kept three or four months, or longer, until the head becomes a fashionable shape. I saw a child about a year old whose head had been recently released from its pressure as I suppose from its looks. All the back part of it was of a purple color as if it had been sadly bruised. We are told this custom is wearing away very fast, there is only a few tribes on this river who practice it."

Charlotte Pangra was annoyed by another activity of some Indians who were camped near the ferry on the Snake River. Charlotte wrote, "We had an all night serenade by the Indians who have a shade a few rods up the river. They sung or chanted and gamboled for Mockingwans leggins and such things all night keeping us awake much.

A few of the women journal writers became involved with Indians they met on the trail. Myra Eel Is and Mary Walker sewed dresses for many of the Indian, wives of the fur traders in their caravan and at the rendezvous in Wyoming. Eliza Spalding worked to put the Nez Perce language in written form at the mission in the Oregon Territory.

Eliza McAuley became friends with an Indian she met at Smith's Fork of the Bear River while the men in her party were building a new road. Eliza wrote,

"1852. At dinner time a very intelligent Indian named Poro came to our camp. He says he has been to the Missouri River and seen steamboats and explained by signs what they were like. He seems to understand the customs of the whites very well. In the afternoon he came again, bringing his little boy, four or five years old. He interpreted a number of Indian words for us... Poro visited us again and brought his friend Pavee to see us. Old Poro came along about ten o'clock and stayed a long time, teaching us his language. It pleases him very much to see us try to learn it. Poro came twice today to bid us goodbye and feels very sad about our going."
FUR TRADERS AND MOUNTAIN MEN

The women on the trail were curious about these mountain men who lived in the wilderness among the Indians. In their journals the first white woman on the trail described the fur trader and their Indian wives with whom the missionaries travelled.

The missionaries who were going to Oregon to live among and serve the Indians were interested in the Indian women who travelled with the fur traders' caravan. Sarah Smith described the wives of Captain Dripps: 'Several female Indians are journeying with us. The two wives of Capt. Dripps. They are trimmed off in high style, I assure you. The oldest wife rides a beautiful white horse, her saddle ornamented with beads and many little gingles. A beautiful white sheepskin covering for the horse, cut in fringes one half a yard deep, ornamented with collars and a great number of thimbles pierced in the top and hung to the Tinge like little balls, making a fine gingle as she rides along. Then comes the rider with her scarlet blanket, painted face and handkerchief on her head, sitting astride. This is the fashion of the country. The second wife acts as an attendant.

Laziness, dirtiness, and ignorance were the three main criticisms which the missionary women directed at the fur traders' Indian wives. Sarah summed up her opinions in her journal. 'Last eve we received a call from one of the wives of some trader she was dressed in fine style. Perhaps her dress cost 100 dollars. It was trimmed in beads and other ornaments throughout and beads of a costly kind about her neck. Her dress was mountain sheepskin, white and soft as kid. I certainly never saw so much ornament but it all showed the barrenness of her mind. It is said these trappers take great pleasure in dressing their Indian brides, but care not for their minds.

Sarah also described the Jim Bridger trading party which they met in Wyoming.

'Received a salute from some of Bridger's party who have just arrived. This company consists of about 100 men and perhaps 60 Indian females and a great number of half-breed children. Their arrival was attended with firing of guns and noisy shouts. Their appearance was rude and savage, were painted in a most hideous manner.
Compare and Contrast

Although both of the readings are written in two very different forms, we can still get a sense as to how the people in those readings felt towards the “other” or the people who were different. Answer the following questions.

1. Based on the “First Ship Seen by the Clatsop”, what kind of feelings were the Native American’s feeling when the first Spaniard ship arrived on shore? How do you know?

2. How did the Natives compare what they were seeing for the first time to what they see in their everyday life?

3. Based on the journal entries by women traveling on the Oregon Trail, why did the majority of the women think poorly of the Native Americans?

4. Give one example of a woman who thought fondly of the Native American’s she met.
5. How are the readings similar?

6. How are the readings different?
Compare and Contrast Answer Key

Although both of the readings are written in two very different forms, we can still get a sense as to how the people in those readings felt towards the “other” or the people who were different. Answer the following questions.

Answers will vary depending on the student’s interpretation of the readings.

1. Based on the “First Ship Seen by the Clatsop”, what kind of feelings were the Native American’s feeling when the first Spaniard ship arrived on shore? How do you know?

There were mixed feelings from the Natives. Some Natives were scared and running and hiding from the ship. Other Natives were in awe of what they saw. Because they had never seen a ship before they thought it was a whale at first and also that the men on the ship were bears because of their clothing.

2. How did the Natives compare what they were seeing for the first time to what they see in their everyday life?

Because the Natives had never seen a ship before they thought it was a whale. The men were also wearing big clothing and had beards, which made the Natives think they were perhaps bears.

3. Based on the journal entries by women traveling on the Oregon Trail, why did the majority of the women think poorly of the Native Americans?

The Natives customs were very different from the women who were traveling on the Oregon Trail. One custom that really baffled the women was the flattening of the baby’s heads. This was a custom that the women founds horrid. They felt bad for the babies and did not understand this practice.

4. Give one example of a woman who thought fondly of the Native American’s she met.

Eliza became friends with Poro, who was a Native who would visit Eliza often. Poro would teach Eliza and other settlers his language so they could communicate. Poro was sad when Eliza left, which goes to show they had built a friendship.
5. How are the readings similar?
   - Both readings are told from a female point of view.
   - Both readings indicate first impressions of the “other”.
   - Two cultures are coming together for the first time in both readings.
   - In both readings each culture thought the other had “weird” physical features.

6. How are the readings different?
   - The journal entries were mostly opinions.
   - The time period of each reading was different.
   - The women on the Oregon Trail wrote journal entries to explain their encounters.
   - The “First Ship Seen by the Clatsop” was a tribal story passed down from generation to generation explaining their first encounter with Europeans.
**Venn Diagram**
Pre-Termination and Perspectives

**The Canoe:** In this section, have students write down details as they read “The First Ship Seen by the Clatsop”. They could also include the author’s perspective as one of the details.

**The Wagon:** In this section, have students write down details as they read the Oregon Trail Journals. They could also include the author’s perspective as one of the details.

**Overlap:** The canoe and the wagon overlap above the front wagon wheel. In this section, have students write down the similar details and perspectives of the authors.